

Perhaps anxious to avoid concluding on such a grim and depressing note, Puckey instead ends by discussing the modern-day settlement of the Muriwhenua Treaty claims, a process that has dragged out over more than two decades. The modest re-capitalisation of far northern iwi is unlikely on its own to prove sufficient to reverse the socio-economic fortunes of Māori in the area. But understanding the origins of a problem can often prove crucial in overcoming it, and in this respect Puckey's book should be required reading for all those interested in the future fate of the Far North.

VINCENT O'MALLEY

HistoryWorks

Behold the Moon: The European Occupation of the Dunedin District 1770–1848 (revised edition). By Peter Entwisle. Port Daniel Press with the assistance of the Alfred and Isabel Reed Trust administered by the Otago Settlers' Association, Dunedin, 2010. 300pp. Paperback: NZ price \$49. ISBN: 978-0-473-17534-4.

DERIVING ITS IMAGINATIVE NAME from a Māori chant transcribed by David Samwell at Queen Charlotte Sound during Cook's third voyage there in 1777, this book is the revised version of Peter Entwisle's 1998 one of the same name. Both books have as their initial frame of reference a brief contextual description of the wider socio-political and cultural worlds of Europeans in the time leading up to the arrival of sealers, whalers, traders and eventually missionaries in the South Island of New Zealand. Supporting his thesis that the beginnings of the European occupation of the Dunedin district were inextricably linked with the early arrival of small parties of such people in coastal Otago and Southland, Entwisle describes their interaction and assimilation into small, dispersed Māori communities that became nuclei for exchange. He also describes the separate formation of European shore whaling establishments, for example, to which Māori became attracted for work and to trade. Some Europeans formed affinal relationships with the locals, became more settled, cultivated gardens, kept stock, and some became Pākeha–Māori who 'facilitated interchanges not always of a mutually beneficial sort' (p.63).

This book is a story about place, resources, the formation of relationships and sometimes about violence and its causes. It is also about hopes and the survival of people from two different worlds, living together in communities. Entwisle shows how prior to the arrival at Otago harbour of New Zealand Company surveyors and immigrants, and before the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi, small, independent land settlement schemes were initiated by entrepreneurial whalers and traders such as John Jones, who encouraged missionary Watkin to settle in the vicinity. Thus, the early formation and population of Dunedin did not happen in isolation from the existing villages, whaling and former sealing communities where the socio-cultural and agricultural groundwork to 'sustain the Wakefield settlers in their first months of need', had already been done and 'was effectively achieved by the mid-1830s' (p.163).

The revised edition of *Behold the Moon* achieves the stated aim of its author in elaborating on and clarifying some descriptions of these events and people who were mentioned in the first edition, but in less depth. This has been attained by further research, and access to an increased number of archival sources. Some errors of fact that became apparent from the earlier research are of course omitted, and conversely some new facts have come to hand and been used to balance the narrative regarding the planning, surveying and population growth in the greater Dunedin area during the 1840s. However, the main intention of the revision appears to be the incorporation of

matters raised by the ‘Creed manuscript’ (p.6). Both editions of the book focus on the ‘Sophia Affray’ that occurred in November 1817 when Captain John Kelly visited the environs of Port Daniel (Otago harbour) to trade for potatoes. There was an altercation in which three sealers were killed. One, whose checkered career has been described in Entwisle’s book *Taka: a Vignette Life of William Tucker 1784–1817, Convict, Sealer, Trader in Human Heads, Otago Settler, New Zealand’s First Fine Art Dealer*¹, is a key figure in the Creed manuscript and in the archival accounts of the Sophia incident. The author had previously used the Sophia affray and Tucker’s role in it to explain how it was that Māori came to attack the sealers. But now that this new manuscript has come to light he sees this affray as having different origins and more in the nature of an on-going war with sealers that began during the visit of another sealing gang.

The first edition of *Behold the Moon* contains a large number of footnotes and nine appendices (46pp.) of supporting information, including reports of court proceedings, biographical material and population data. The revised edition adds to this by having 16 appendices (107pp.) that include, in addition, transcripts of ships’ journals and of the Creed manuscript. All of these are most useful for evaluating the conclusions the author has reached, and also for personal research and reference.

The author’s writing is meticulous in attention to detail and the appendices and endnotes are very long, with all thinking carefully detailed. The book nevertheless retains his clear aim of attempting to bring these events and people to life in the same manner as the first edition. The author compares his own views with those of others in the field, and constantly reviews his interpretations in the light of better understandings coming to hand; so this book, like all good scholarship, is clearly a ‘work in progress’. If there is a criticism of the interpretive aspect of the work, it is that there are too many inferences and over-interpretations based upon quite ‘thin’ evidence. Thus Entwisle says at one point:

[I]t seems clear that he was here as the agent of some owner or operator to assist the provisioning of vessels and to assemble cargoes of commodities such as flax and sealskins. If his principal was John Grono . . . the livestock were . . . perhaps also intended as breedstock . . . for future ship’s provisions. It seems he had another line of business . . . (p.65, my emphasis).

This kind of interpretation appears to go much further than the evidence would allow, since the actual Creed manuscript says, in respect of this issue, only that the person concerned ‘lived 2 years at Wariakiaki — sheep and goats — afterwards went to Hobart town . . .’ (with a marginal note ‘lived with native woman no child built home’. Original MS p.13² transcribed in Appendix V1 p.195).

Entwisle’s argument that the Creed manuscript also enables a different interpretation of the Sophia incident as an ongoing matter of utu, which he calls ‘the war of the shirt’, seems correct (p.56). But it is one small manuscript that was transcribed from oral narration after Creed’s arrival in Waikouaiti at least 27 years after the events being referred to. It is important therefore that the evidence is not added to by excessive speculation. On the other hand, such connection of facts by suggestion is thought provoking for some readers and serves the purpose at times of ‘adding flesh to the bones’ of what might otherwise be an academic argument only.

Beyond the Moon is a book which revisits a field of enquiry that has been kept alive by many authors since it was first documented thoroughly by McNab (1907, 1909, 1913) at the beginning of last century. McNab’s researches and the documents that informed them have been re-addressed over and over again, but more recent socio-political approaches to the interpretation of archival material can always cast a new light upon the lives of the people being described. Some of those people are our ancestors, so genealogists, local people and scholars alike will find Peter Entwisle’s work in both editions of *Behold the*

Moon a mine of accessible information and references, as well as providing entertainment and tools to think with.

ANNETTE WILKES

University of Canterbury

NOTES

- 1 Port Daniel Press, Dunedin, 2005.
- 2 Creed in John White, MSS- Papers-1187-201 & 202, ATL, Wellington.

The Silence Beyond — Selected Writings. By Michael King, with an introduction by Rachael King. Penguin Books, Auckland, 2011. 240pp. NZ price: \$41.99. ISBN: 978-0-14356-556-7.

THIS COLLECTION OF ESSAYS BY MICHAEL KING is an enjoyable read. As always, his writing is beautifully clear. His clipped sentences, vivid images and clever, often circular, structures are a delight. The content is unfailingly engaging. There are some fascinating stories. At times the book is very funny indeed; at other times it is deeply self-reflective and revealing.

The question for this journal is what value the book is for the historian, as distinct from the reader who wants intelligent entertainment. What one might expect from the posthumous essays of a fine historian would be short interpretive pieces about the past — snippets of research which were left over from larger book projects. There are three essays on Māori–Pākehā relations, but these are more amplifications of the polemical arguments in *Being Pakeha* than any new contributions about the history of that relationship. The last essay, ‘Maori and Pakeha: Which People and Culture has Primacy?’, is refreshingly direct on the claims of Pākehā culture alongside Māori, but it is a personal reflection, not a report on research. The essays have no footnotes, and few references to historiography. There are a couple of unfortunate typos. Eleven of the 18 essays have been published before.

So what would a historian find of value in the book? For any Pākehā contemplating working on Māori history, there is an excellent essay about Michael’s learning from the path-breaking television series, *Tangata Whenua*. It is an invaluable guide on process and etiquette, and should be compulsory reading for students of Māori history.

The book also provides a most useful collection for anyone interested in Michael King’s life. King was an important person in New Zealand historiography, partly because he helped develop new audiences for the subject and partly because he uncovered with high-quality research some really important stories — the life of Te Puea, the Moriori tragedy, the biographies of Frank Sargeson and Janet Frame, for example. At some point someone will write the biography which Michael never had the chance to do for himself, and for that biographer this volume is a good start. Three of the essays are explicitly about his own life — two are exercises in family history, and the third is a piece about growing up as a Kiwi male. Nearly all the others are in the first person and are laced with autobiographical anecdotes. Just on the basis of this volume alone, the outlines of his formative influences become clear — the Irish-Catholic heritage; a father who collected New Zealand books and whose advertising business brought him into contact with writers from Pat Lawlor to Denis Glover; the discovery of history around the Pauatahanui inlet with the help of James Cowan; the repression of St Pat’s Silverstream and the release at Victoria University. For those readers interested in Michael’s life, one would have liked more context before each essay — why it was written, who was the audience, what was