I have some small gripes about the book, too. The chapters are stand-alone to such an extent that there is a degree of repetition: for example, the list of severe snowstorms hitting Mt Peel between 1862 and 1908 appears four times. There is also much in common between the introductory and concluding chapters. The maps do not match the approach of the book: Peden emphasises environment, and while one map lays out differing vegetation zones, there is no rainfall map, which would have been helpful in identifying the arid and semi-arid zones described in the text, particularly in chapter three about rabbits (where aridity is important!). Peden (and the AUP editor) also assume a lot of South Island knowledge on the part of the reader in that, for example, not all places mentioned in the text feature on maps. These are small complaints but they were distracting in a book where the author has otherwise taken scrupulous care to bring precision and vigour to the topic.

KATE HUNTER

Victoria University of Wellington

Trading Cultures: A History of the Far North. By Adrienne Puckey. Huia Publishers, Wellington, 2011. 382pp. NZ Price: $45. ISBN: 978-1-86969-454-8.

ADRIENNE PUCKEY'S *TRADING CULTURES* suffers from something of an identity crisis. Is it, as the subtitle claims, a history of the Far North, a history of far northern iwi, or a history of Māori and Pākehā economic encounters in the region? In truth, the work covers something of all three facets, though with the emphasis firmly on the economic component. That would seem, in part, to reflect the book's apparent origins in the author's doctoral thesis on the economic history of the area between 1860 and 1940.

Another factor may also be evident in the shape of the work. Perhaps the lack of a clear focus in itself reveals something almost unique about the history of the region. Unlike in most other parts of New Zealand, Māori in the Far North did not fade to the economic and social margins of society under the onslaught of nineteenth-century colonisation. Settlers came in a trickle rather than a flood, leaving Māori major players in a region that (as the blurb declares with a touch of hyperbole) went from being a 'bread basket' in the late eighteenth century to 'an economic basket case' by the 1990s.

Puckey, a descendant of Kaitaia-based missionary William Puckey, writes that her book seeks to weave a path between triumphalist pioneer history and more recent 'grievance' histories. Yet as the Waitangi Tribunal's 1997 *Muriwhenua Land Report* graphically demonstrated, the expropriation of Muriwhenua Māori lands and resources was to have a serious impact upon local hapū and iwi. That is a history that Puckey draws upon freely in her own work, if sometimes rather too uncritically, especially when it comes to the contentious question of the nature and meaning of early land dealings between Māori and Pākehā.

It is not that Puckey is necessarily wrong in her acceptance of the so-called 'tuku whenua' thesis — a concept promoted during the Waitangi Tribunal's Muriwhenua hearings that Māori in the region did not understand themselves to be selling their lands to the incoming Europeans, but rather letting them occupy these on a more conditional basis consistent with tikanga. The problem is instead her failure to engage with — or even to acknowledge in any serious way — the considerable volume of evidence to the contrary promoted by Crown historians in that inquiry. As Puckey observes later in the book, the Tribunal's report was a contentious and controversial one. But whereas Michael Belgrave's *Historical Frictions* carefully and critically sifted through the evidence available in that debate, highlighting a more complex set of cultural exchanges than

could safely be understood by the binary sale versus gift argument, Puckey seems too ready to assume the self-evident truth of the 'tuku whenua' argument, rather than trying to prove it.

Puckey herself provides ample evidence of this more nuanced mingling of cultures, including the Kaitaia Treaty signing that fused elements of both Māori and Pākehā custom and protocol. It was Te Rarawa rangatira Nopera Panakareao who had famously declared during the course of that ceremony that the shadow of the land only went to Queen Victoria, leaving the substance to Māori, a judgment which he reversed within less than a year. The arrival of the Crown complicated existing relations between Māori and Pākehā in the north, besides imposing a range of additional burdens on the tribes. These factors contributed to the outbreak of the Northern War in 1845, a conflict in which Panakareao provided nominal support to the British — just enough, Puckey suggests, to give proof of his solidarity with the Crown without further antagonising Hone Heke.

Although Puckey discusses the Northern War she fails to fully explore its long-term consequences. In effect, the Crown turned its back on the north for many years after 1846, condemning it to the status of an economic backwater (even though the Far North benefitted in the short term by the diversion of trade and shipping from the Bay of Islands). The Crown was happy to purchase extensive lands in the region. But for the most part the promised infrastructure was never built, and the new markets for Māori commerce did not follow.

The tide was turning in favour of Pākehā. Puckey argues that the decisive factor in the Far North was not the New Zealand Wars of the 1860s, but the arrival of the Native Land Court in the region. Yet it was British victory in the Waikato conflict that gave the government confidence to impose a range of more coercive and assimilationist measures on Māori communities, including rolling out the Native Land Court. Regardless of where they lived, all Māori were thus impacted by the outcome of the wars.

Where Puckey's work really comes into its element is in its coverage of the economic options available to far northern Māori from about the 1860s. For many Māori, that meant a life of toiling on the gumfields, often on Crown or European lands. In some cases the gum diggers became ensnared in an exploitative system controlled by a few European traders who relied heavily upon debt entrapment. The establishment of co-operative stores and even banks constituted one response to this kind of predatory behaviour.

Yet important though gum digging was, it was never the sole source of income for Māori in the Far North. As Puckey demonstrates, Māori in the region tried their hand (with varying levels of success) at a wide range of other endeavours, from sheep and dairy farming, through to flax harvesting, fishing, forestry and other forms of enterprise. The challenges confronting them were familiar ones — inadequate capital, poorly developed infrastructure, the loss of their most fertile and productive lands. Māori communities found themselves well down the list of priorities when it came to the construction of roads or other basic amenities, and short of finance with which to develop their meagre remaining estates.

Grinding poverty was the outcome for many Māori, a situation that persists through to the present day, as graphically seen in the presence of Third World diseases in the region. As Puckey tells it, by the twentieth century Māori in the Far North found themselves caught in a classic spiral of underdevelopment: 'poor health and poor housing resulting from low incomes could only be improved with steady employment, which, in turn, was more available to people with adequate education, which was not generally available to low-income earners' (p.267). If the advent of the welfare state after 1938 helped to mitigate some of these factors for a time, its virtual demise, accompanied by restructuring of Crown enterprises in the late 1980s, hit the region hard, especially as newly unemployed urban Māori returned to their home communities.

Perhaps anxious to avoid concluding on such a grim and depressing note, Puckey instead ends by discussing the modern-day settlement of the Muriwhenua Treaty claims, a process that has dragged out over more than two decades. The modest re-capitalisation of far northern iwi is unlikely on its own to prove sufficient to reverse the socio-economic fortunes of Māori in the area. But understanding the origins of a problem can often prove crucial in overcoming it, and in this respect Puckey's book should be required reading for all those interested in the future fate of the Far North.

VINCENT O'MALLEY
HistoryWorks

Behold the Moon: The European Occupation of the Dunedin District 1770–1848 (revised edition). By Peter Entwisle. Port Daniel Press with the assistance of the Alfred and Isabel Reed Trust administered by the Otago Settlers' Association, Dunedin, 2010. 300pp. Paperback: NZ price $49. ISBN: 978-0-473-17534-4.

DERIVING ITS IMAGINATIVE NAME from a Māori chant transcribed by David Samwell at Queen Charlotte Sound during Cook's third voyage there in 1777, this book is the revised version of Peter Entwisle's 1998 one of the same name. Both books have as their initial frame of reference a brief contextual description of the wider socio-political and cultural worlds of Europeans in the time leading up to the arrival of sealers, whalers, traders and eventually missionaries in the South Island of New Zealand. Supporting his thesis that the beginnings of the European occupation of the Dunedin district were inextricably linked with the early arrival of small parties of such people in coastal Otago and Southland, Entwisle describes their interaction and assimilation into small, dispersed Māori communities that became nuclei for exchange. He also describes the separate formation of European shore whaling establishments, for example, to which Māori became attracted for work and to trade. Some Europeans formed affinal relationships with the locals, became more settled, cultivated gardens, kept stock, and some became Pākeha–Māori who 'facilitated interchanges not always of a mutually beneficial sort' (p.63).

This book is a story about place, resources, the formation of relationships and sometimes about violence and its causes. It is also about hopes and the survival of people from two different worlds, living together in communities. Entwisle shows how prior to the arrival at Otago harbour of New Zealand Company surveyors and immigrants, and before the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi, small, independent land settlement schemes were initiated by entrepreneurial whalers and traders such as John Jones, who encouraged missionary Watkin to settle in the vicinity. Thus, the early formation and population of Dunedin did not happen in isolation from the existing villages, whaling and former sealing communities where the socio-cultural and agricultural groundwork to 'sustain the Wakefield settlers in their first months of need', had already been done and 'was effectively achieved by the mid-1830s' (p.163).

The revised edition of *Behold the Moon* achieves the stated aim of its author in elaborating on and clarifying some descriptions of these events and people who were mentioned in the first edition, but in less depth. This has been attained by further research, and access to an increased number of archival sources. Some errors of fact that became apparent from the earlier research are of course omitted, and conversely some new facts have come to hand and been used to balance the narrative regarding the planning, surveying and population growth in the greater Dunedin area during the 1840s. However, the main intention of the revision appears to be the incorporation of