

endnote 105, Chapter 7, dealing with the minor matter of a theft from the library, has at least nine cited sources. But these are very minor blemishes.

The narrative pace is sustained by a sense of an institution moving inexorably towards its apotheosis as a true legislative library, no longer collection dependent, narrowly and effectively focussed on supplying the information needs of its parliamentary clients. To some future historian will be left the task of exploring why, once the library had reached this high point in the provision of information, Parliament and its members were held in such low esteem, so much legislation was botched, and the standard and content of debate was so low compared with the past when it functioned as a collection-centred library with next to no reference and research services.

Martin has provided, for the Parliamentary Library, the firm base essential for further testing of the wider and more complex issues in the development of New Zealand's libraries.

J.E. TRAUER

Wellington

Personal Narratives of Irish and Scottish Migration, 1921–65, 'For Spirit and Adventure'. By Angela McCarthy. Manchester University Press, Manchester and New York, 2007. 257pp. US price: \$74.95. ISBN 978-0-7190-7352-6; *Irish Migration Networks and Ethnic Identities Since 1700*. Edited by Enda Delaney and Donald M. MacRaild. Routledge, London and New York, 2007. 305pp. US price: \$150.00. ISBN 978-0-415-39053-8.

THESE SUPERB BOOKS showcase exciting new research by scholars working at the cutting edge of migration history. Over the years historians have used a wide range of tools to explore aspects of global mobility, drawing selectively on the literature in disciplines such as sociology and anthropology. More recently, however, one senses that the traffic in ideas and methods across disciplinary boundaries has intensified and that historians in the field are engaging with — and producing — more sophisticated theoretical frameworks. Nowhere has this been more apparent than in the renewed emphasis on the role of migratory social networks in facilitating movement and shaping its timing and direction. Building on various network theorizations, migration historians have demonstrated that these institutions were crucial to patterns of departure, settlement and adaptation over time, and to the kinds of ties which developed with 'homelands' and other migrant destinations. This research trajectory has forced scholars to move their analyses beyond the boundaries of the nation-state and encouraged them to frame their inquiries in terms of diaspora and transnationalism, sometimes using comparative strategies. Recent studies like those under review have enriched our understanding of migrant lives, sharpened our conceptual weaponry and introduced new topics and ways to approach the past.

Angela McCarthy's *Personal Narratives of Irish and Scottish Migration* exemplifies the richness and perspicacity of the latest wave of migration scholarship. It seeks to capture the experiences of migrants from Scotland and Ireland — both north and south — to the United States and the British World destinations of Canada, Australia and New Zealand between the 1920s and the 1960s. To accomplish this task, the author exploits the 'raw migrant narratives' preserved in personal correspondence, oral interviews, shipboard diaries and written questionnaires. The sheer scale of the evidential base is breathtaking. Research Fellowships at the AHRC Centre for Irish and Scottish Studies at the University of Aberdeen, the National Maritime Museum at Greenwich and the Stout Research Centre enabled McCarthy to bring together material from an impressive range of archival collections. As a result, she is ideally placed to illuminate the social

worlds of individual migrants and to trace the fine detail of their journeys. The substantive chapters reveal the breadth of the enterprise: considering going; organizing the move; getting there; Ellis Island and New York; entering the British World; personal and group networks; identity, culture and belonging; and going home. These diverse themes are expertly woven together with the connecting threads of transnationalism, memory and personal testimony. The book is a strikingly original contribution to the international historiography of migration and a model application of the comparative method to historical writing.

Personal Narratives is a fine read, for all its conceptual sophistication and methodological complexity, and one that will cement McCarthy's reputation as a leading scholar in the field. The images reproduced here are highly evocative and match the tone and mood of the text. Most impressive, perhaps, is the generosity with which the author quotes from the personal narratives at the heart of the book, something that this reviewer found effective and deeply moving. It is hard not to be troubled by the picture of a menstruating 14-year-old, Anne Walsh of County Cavan, stripped naked at Ellis Island in 1922: 'It was a room that had no ceiling and they used hoses to hose us down and one nurse said, "You poor little kid", she said to me, this is terrible' (p.113). Likewise Lorna Carter's excitement aboard the *Atlantis* in 1951 as she contemplated New Zealand: 'I see away on the starboard side mountains just like our coast and snow capped peaks in the distance. I just feel that I'm sailing home from Kyle to Mallaig and I've got the feeling that I'm going to love this [*word illegible*] land' (p.136). Manchester University Press deserves praise for allowing the author such latitude. New Zealand readers will also be grateful for the extensive coverage given to this country within the book and the fresh insights it brings to local migration history.

Enda Delaney and Donald MacRaild have assembled a stellar cast for their outstanding volume of essays on the activities of social networks in the process of Irish migration. The timescale covered in their collection is extensive, stretching from Andrea Knox's treatment of Irish women in eighteenth-century Spain to Delaney's incisive analysis of their compatriots in post-war Britain. The editors make a convincing case for conceptualizing the Irish diaspora as 'a series of movements over time' rather than a unitary phenomenon bound inextricably to the catastrophic events of the famine decade (1846–1855). They construct a broad chronology that encompasses 'the circular migration within Europe in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries; Ulster migration to North America in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries; the great mass migrations of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries; and the short-distance flow to Britain from the mid-1930s onwards' (p.viii). At the same time, their understanding of social networks is sufficiently wide-ranging to include institutions such as Orange Lodges, churches and burial societies, alongside the informal varieties associated with the ties of kinship and neighbourhood. The temporal and organizational reach of the essays is matched by a geographical spread that includes Europe, the Caribbean, Great Britain, North America and Australasia. In each of these detailed studies, Irish migrants emerge as creative historical actors who gained some degree of control over their everyday lives by using the cultural materials and resources available to them.

New Zealand is well represented in the volume and its accompanying footnotes. Angela McCarthy provides a convincing interpretation of personal letters that reveals the crucial importance of transnational interactions among Irish migrants to this country and their connections elsewhere. Donald MacRaild focuses on the Orange Order in the north of England, but his analysis introduces a strong comparative dimension and he depicts the popular movement as a 'societal web strung out across the world' (p.183). His essay is neatly complemented by David Fitzpatrick's reading of Orangeism in South Australia (one suspects that the strong non-Irish element he discovers in the organization also holds for New Zealand), and by William Jenkins's brilliant microhistory of associational

networks in the urban spaces of Buffalo and Toronto. A comparative framework also underpins David Gleeson and Brendan Buttimer's account of changing ethnic networks among the Irish in the southern US cities of Charleston and Savannah, and Alan O'Day's humanely skeptical perspective on the 'overseas tours' of Irish nationalist leaders. The remaining case studies travel in fruitful directions: Craig Bailey to the operation of patronage among middle-class London Irish in the eighteenth-century empire; Louise Miskell and Paul O'Leary to aspects of respectability in South Wales; and John Belchem to 'philanthropic voluntarism' and what he calls the 'ethnic enterprise' of Irish Catholics in mid-nineteenth-century Liverpool.

Personal Narratives and the essays in *Networks* are very important contributions to the field of migration history and essential reading for those teaching in the area. These books should inspire new work — here and abroad — that builds on the methods and frameworks applied with such precision and power by the authors.

LYNDON FRASER

University of Canterbury

Separate but Equal? Maori Schools and the Crown 1867–1969. By John Barrington. Victoria University Press, Wellington, 2008. 383pp. NZ price: \$60.00. ISBN 978-0-86473-586-7.

THIS IS JOHN BARRINGTON'S second history of Maori schools; his first, written with T.H. Beaglehole, was the standard work in this area for many years.¹ That earlier work originated in two MA theses: Beaglehole's account of missionary schooling from 1816 until warfare closed most of the mission schools in the 1860s, and Barrington's study of Maori schools from the passage of the Native Schools Act in 1867 until the transfer of the Maori primary schools to education board control in 1969. This new treatment of the latter period draws on a substantial body of research by Barrington and others since the 1970s, including theses, work for the Waitangi Tribunal and oral history.

Why, one might ask, another history so soon after Judith Simon and Linda Smith's 2001 account of the Native School system?² *Separate but Equal?* deals in more detail with a wider range of schools than Simon and Smith's work and traces the origins and consequences of educational policies and administrative arrangements. Although Simon and Smith refer to other schools, they focus on life in the Department of Education's Native (later Maori) primary schools. *Separate but Equal?* deals not only with Native Schools, denominational boarding schools for Maori, and state secondary schooling for Maori in designated district high schools but also — briefly — with Maori in mainstream primary and secondary schools before World War Two. Of the book's 12 chapters, three of the most substantial are devoted to secondary schooling.

Barrington's study of the Crown's educational dealings with Maori, through the Department of Native Affairs from 1867 until 1879, and through the Department of Education thereafter, is strengthened by his interest in comparative education and in educational administration. He shows how American thinking about schooling for Indians and blacks helped shape education in Britain's African possessions and how British colonial policy provided a useful justification for New Zealand officials' plans for 'relevant' schooling for Maori.

Maori were not, of course, the only New Zealanders threatened with a 'relevant' education during the first half of the twentieth century. Truby King campaigned for domestically oriented schooling for the future mothers of the race and George Hogben, permanent head of the Department of Education 1899–1915, wanted district high