

to *Caught Mapping* but ultimately it proved to be a far more stimulating book than anticipated. It will be enjoyed by many readers. The thought remains, however, that it might more appropriately have been titled ‘an idiosyncratic collection of interesting life histories of folk living in the nineteenth-century South Island who just happened to be surveyors’.

BRAD PATTERSON

Victoria University of Wellington

Class and Occupation: The New Zealand Reality. By Erik Olssen and Maureen Hickey. University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 2005. 317 pp. NZ Price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877373-03-X; *Class, Gender and the Vote: Historical Perspectives from New Zealand.* Edited by Miles Fairburn and Erik Olssen. University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 2005. 288 pp. NZ Price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877332-02-1.

CLASS AND OCCUPATION, which arises from the now decades-long research on South Dunedin undertaken at the University of Otago, is a serious and solid technical volume which discusses at considerable length the difficulties of quantitative reconstruction of New Zealand society. The biggest problem is the persistent destruction of census returns, a practice which draws the authors’ restrained fury. As they note, New Zealand is the only developed nation in the world to have done this, and it means international comparisons as well as much domestic research are now impossible. A second major problem is the frequent changes in census occupational categorizations, which mean extraordinarily tedious and painstaking reconstruction is required for comparisons across time. Much praise is due to the authors and their collaborators for their efforts which, as they say, mean no one will have to do this work again (lengthy tabular appendices make the results readily available). There are illuminating discussions, too, of the making of the New Zealand census and particularly of the way in which inflexibility obscured women’s position in the labour market, and Maori were totally excluded from consideration until 1926. We have a useful justification of combining Marxist and Weberian approaches to class, the authors’ position being that relationship to the means of production is an essential starting-point, but account must be taken of variations in skill, knowledge, authority, status and types of labour contract. As a result, a nine-class model is advanced which, as the authors observe, can be merged into a five- or even three-class model. There is detailed discussion of each class, and the processes of its enumeration, with attention also being paid to issues of scale and representativeness. This material will invite other scholars to consider whether differences of status really justify categorization into distinct classes; this, after all, is a fundamental difference between Marxist and Weberian approaches.

The authors understandably anticipate objections to their work by drawing attention to the enormous amount of time that has been spent in getting a quantitative historical analysis even to this point. A reviewer, in danger of being invited to go and do the work him or herself if greater expertise is claimed, is naturally cautious in advancing criticisms. Yet, as the authors acknowledge, although their tables include rural occupations, their discussion and analysis is largely confined to the urban occupational structure. The rural class structure was an important dimension in New Zealand as in other settler societies. That being so, the subtitle may more usefully have been ‘The New Zealand Urban Reality’. The missing rural dimension is emphasized by the authors’ point that their upper three classes — large employers and higher managers, professionals and semi-professionals — are roughly the bourgeoisie in Marxist terms. Given the centrality of primary production to the upper levels of urban enterprise, particularly financial and mercantile firms, there is still work to be done in integrating rural and urban class structure.

The inclusion of rural occupations in one of the appendices is useful but it would be better to sort them according to class rather than leave them all in one category.

Class, Gender and the Vote, an edited collection arising from extensively funded research projects at the Universities of Canterbury and Otago, is naturally broader in its range, with some excellent material, and I can only agree with one of the contributors, Lydia Bloy, on the merits of studying class. Perhaps the most widely useful chapter among many good ones is the last: David Hood's discussion of best practice in quantitative historical research.

Miles Fairburn and Stephen Haslett, in finding considerable residential and occupational stability across four decades of rapid social change, are perhaps setting up a slightly odd hypothesis to test. Four decades is approximately one working life, and some might not be so surprised that stability coexists with change. This is a useful discussion, but larger issues to do with the meaning of class in twentieth-century New Zealand await detailed treatment.

Erik Olssen's chapter on marriage patterns is a model of how careful statistical analysis can both bear out and subtly modify what we think we know about such matters. In a similar vein, although on a smaller scale, Howard Baldwin's discussion of Otago Boys' High School and occupational mobility is also very useful (one only wishes for a similar study of Otago Girls' High). Michael Smith provides a nuanced discussion of residential segregation in Christchurch, which demonstrates that while segregation is broadly as the stereotype has it, there are important if subtle variations and qualifications.

Gender is the particular focus of Linda Moore's study of women and voting. Her discussion of 1893 is very interesting and provides further evidence that William Pember Reeves was an ungrateful bastard when it came to women's support for the Liberals. Moore also emphasizes the official domestication of women after 1905, whereby both census and electoral registration required women to be described by marital status. Soren Wendelken's interesting analysis of *Maoriland Worker* cartoons could have been expanded by a stronger gender analysis of some of the cartoons. Also emphasizing gender, John Stenhouse makes a good case for taking religion seriously, although his chapter is marred by a few egregious errors: Stout did not become Chief Justice in the early twentieth century; Ballance did not become premier in 1889 (both p.63) and one imagines that the divisive waterfront strike was in 1890, not 1891 (p.66). Similar errors mar Steve Kerr's interesting biography of Clyde Carr: Carr could not have supported Dan Sullivan in Riccarton in 1922, as Sullivan was already the MP for Avon, and provinces never had premiers.

The strongest rural chapter is Eleanor Cottle's very painstaking discussion of social mobility among the employees of one large high country station. She makes her case well and gives a textbook account of mobility strategies. However, the paternalism which she correctly attributes to the station proprietor might have been precisely the opposite of what she thinks: it may well have been explicitly designed to ensure such movement into independence, at least by the worthy. Steve McLeod gives a good analysis of the rural electorates in 1935, demonstrating that Labour benefited not so much from radicalization of farmers as a much-increased turnout by non-farmers in those electorates.

As with many edited collections, however, the eclecticism of this book is both a strength and a weakness. Diversity of approach is to be welcomed, and there is much interesting and valuable material here. A stronger conceptualization of the relationship between class, gender and political behaviour would have been welcome. Indeed, there was scope for the editors to advance a substantial discussion of class, gender and history in the New Zealand context.

JIM McALOON