

of the WCTU, later becoming a national officeholder and responsible for establishing the (dry) Seamen's Rest. Stalwart of Trinity Church (built to seat 700 by a congregation then numbering 65), she and her fellows gathered clothing and quilts for welfare work; raised funds for mission work at home and abroad, including paying the salary of a missionary doctor in the Punjab; collected over 37,000 stamps for sale in one year; studied; and prayed. Surely this was a life of activism no less than Jack's? Next in line was Jim, one of a small, out-voted coterie of Christchurch Labour councillors arguing for the council to concern itself with social issues. A painter, he aspired to self-employment but was hampered by the effects of an accident. Jim affiliated more strongly to friendly societies than to the trade union, and was committed to Methodism and temperance: his wife's family was influential in all these connections. The next sibling, Sarah, led a life that was primarily domestic — but this Nolan says relatively little about. She too, however, was extensively involved in the Presbyterian Church, was loyalist and patriotic, frequently contributing her musical talent to fund-raising causes. Frank, the youngest, trained as a bootmaker but at the end of the Long Depression became a salesman, eventually taking a job with the Kaiapoi Woollen Mills and becoming a branch manager: the only brother to leave a working-class occupation.

Nolan's achievement here is to make the case for working-class culture beyond political organization; to bring women, religion, patriotism and local politics into the frame. That the McCulloughs were inveterate joiners provides the book's structure as well as its key sources. Each sibling's participation in the organizations to which they belonged, usually as leading figures, is used to illuminate the multiplicity of affiliations generated by this family and in so doing to indicate the variability of the beliefs and commitments flourishing in New Zealand respectable working-class culture — and, if this family is a guide, able to exist in remarkably tolerant accommodation of different opinions. The focus on organizations has a down side, in that it takes away from the book's ostensible focus on family. Insights into family relations tend to be glimpses into the interstices of the book — Jack helping Frank pack his samples, or going to a concert with Sarah. But there is not a great deal on these sibling relationships, the cross-generational relationships, or the marriages — on the ways in which this relatively close family conducted its family life. Sources, of course, may have precluded this.

Nolan points out early that gender has been too often missing from the historiography of class. This book does not especially deal with men as men; the masculinity of the skilled and the authority in the home which that often entailed does not come in for scrutiny. Nor does the home itself receive a great deal of attention, and I would like to have seen more discussion here: decor, food and dress would seem to have a place in thinking about how women enact class. But the book does bring into focus important preoccupations of the respectable women of the working class. The neglect of religion in working-class historiography is in significant part a hidden question of gender, and it receives substantial compensation here. For its variety of achievements, *Kin* is a valuable addition to the literature on class in New Zealand.

ANNABEL COOPER

*University of Otago*

*Ulster–New Zealand Migration and Cultural Transfers*. Edited by Brad Patterson. Four Courts Press, Dublin, 2006. 286 pp. UK price: £45.00. ISBN 1-85182-957-1.

IF, AS ROBIN WINKS SUGGESTS, the study of history is inevitably embedded in its context and time and reflects current preoccupations, we may, like Malcolm Campbell in this volume, wish to ponder why there has been a recent resurgence of interest in

Irish and Scots emigration to the 'white dominions' of empire. Recent publications on New Zealand, notably Donald Akenson's *Half the World From Home: Perspectives on the Irish in New Zealand, 1860–1950* (1990), Lyndon Fraser's *To Tara via Holyhead* (1997), *A Distant Shore* (2000), and Patterson's own *The Irish in New Zealand* (2002), are acknowledged by the editor as one context for the book. Campbell suggests three possible reasons for this growth in interest: the development of 'diasporic' studies (itself a much misused term); the rise of the 'new' British History, with its concern, *pace* Pocock and, more recently, Bridge and Fedorowich, for 'Greater Britain' and the 'neo-Britons' of the later empire; and, finally, the political contexts for the recent practice of British and Irish history, leading to increasing recognition of the diverse cultural identity and heritage of different parts of the 'Atlantic archipelago'. Campbell cautions against a complacent acceptance of these frames, warning in particular that the assumption that this resurgence of interest world-wide is driven by current political events in Britain and Ireland ignores the autonomous quality of research in New Zealand and elsewhere on the character of the 'settler societies' that developed there. British, Irish and New Zealand historians may share an interest in the practice and consequences of Scots, Irish and, indeed, other migratory movements during the nineteenth century, but their agendas and perspectives are likely to be different.

The point is well made. *Ulster–New Zealand Migration and Cultural Transfers* is the second in a series of historical studies published under the aegis of the Institute of Ulster Scots Studies at the University of Ulster, with the general title of 'Ulster and Scotland'. The institute was founded in 2001, and may be fairly said to be a child of the anxious British political desire to be seen to ascribe parity of cultural esteem to Northern Ireland's warring factions, *post* the Belfast Agreement of 1998. Its mission statement includes 'the study of the Ulster diaspora and its influence on the history of the modern world'. The book itself is the outcome of a conference on the Ulster Irish supported by the institute and hosted by Victoria University in July 2004, and may thus be regarded as one small but tangible consequence of the on-going search for cultural equality in Northern Ireland. It is offered as a 'sampler of current research by New Zealand scholars on the Ulster Irish', and addresses some of the questions that are deemed to be key in the field: Who were the Ulster migrants? Did they form distinctive communities in New Zealand? Did they bring with them 'old world' sectarian animosities? And what, in a New Zealand context, did being an Ulster Protestant mean?

Despite some surprising gaps from a New Zealand perspective — there is nothing on the encounter with Maori and women's voices are silent — the book's Northern Irish credentials are clearly impeccable. But in framing its material in terms of 'Ulster', and concentrating on Ulster *Protestants*, it comes perilously close — paradoxically enough — to espousing the sort of essentialist exceptionalism that has long bedevilled studies of Irish emigration in general. While various contributors acknowledge the complexity and contingency of individual cultural and political self-identification, the collection seems predicated on the assumption that specifically 'Ulster' identities and contributions to New Zealand's history are discoverable. The emphasis on Protestants implies that religious affiliation constituted a defining referent for migrant behaviour. Both propositions are worth debating, particularly as they run decidedly counter to the critical scholarship of the 'new' imperial history, but neither is explicitly tested here. Indeed, in his discussion of Ulster settlers and the colonial middle class, Jim McAloon echoes Eric Richards in warning against the assumption that Irish — let alone Ulster — experience in the colonies was in any way distinctive. Thus while Galbraith, in a slightly modified version of his 2000 paper, 'The Invisible Irish?', maps out the grounds for Ulster's regional distinctiveness in the nineteenth century, and notes the frequency with which contemporary travellers observed this, it is by no means clear that this was a perspective shared by Ulster men and women themselves, or one which they took with them to New Zealand. Rather, as

McCarthy's analysis of migrant correspondence, and Dwyer and Fraser's exemplary study of migrant networks in Ellesmere County both show, any surviving ties of place and kinship with Ulster were likely to be highly localized, and represented in terms of an 'Irish' or 'British' identity, rather than a provincial one.

In fact, some of the more 'biographical' contributions struggle to maintain an Ulster focus, which is itself, perhaps, a tacit admission of the success with which many migrants blended into colonial society. In an entertaining chapter on the Ulster-born landowner, businessman and Legislative Council member John Martin, Roberta McIntyre concludes that his success in New Zealand was atypical of his fellow Ulstermen, and makes no claim that it was due to his origins. Similarly, in discussing 'Wellington's Ulster entrepreneurs', the firm of Thompson, Shannon & Co, R.P. Davis concludes that both these Ulstermen displayed 'ambiguous Irish identities that became increasingly colonial', and which were certainly not instrumental in determining the direction of their colonial careers. In his analysis of the political careers of 'Carbuncle Jack and Mr Punch of Canterbury' (John Williamson and Crosbie Ward), Edmund Bohan suggests that neither asserted their Ulster origins, concluding that they were 'among the most "hidden" of (New Zealand's) pioneering Irishmen'. On the other hand, some Ulster migrants seemingly did display a cultural distinctiveness which might, according to circumstance, set them apart or inflect their sense of identity. Brosnahan argues that Rutherford Waddell, the radical Ulster-born Presbyterian minister at St Andrew's, Dunedin, remained set apart throughout his life by his accent and 'personal qualities which his contemporaries perceived as characteristically "Irish"', from the Scots Presbyterianism in which he was immersed. Garnham explores the case of a sportsman William (John) Reynolds, who variously claimed English or Irish nationality as a footballer when purpose suited, in order to further his career in England, Ireland and New Zealand. Finally, the two concluding chapters by Geoffrey Rice and James Watson on perhaps the most famous of New Zealand Ulstermen, Bill Massey, both recognize the complexity of his sense of identity as an Irishman, Ulsterman, British subject and New Zealander, but also the way in which the emphasis shifted according to circumstance.

And this is surely the point. In searching for a specifically 'Ulster' — or indeed any other — 'contribution' to settler society, we have to recognize that any sense of collective identity derived from shared ethnicity and cultural experience will at best have only ever been partial, and to that extent, fragile and vulnerable to individual circumstance. Thus the numbers and regional and demographic characteristics of the Ulster migrants so carefully delineated by Jock Phillips only begin the story. In New Zealand as in Ulster, they acted as individuals, even when, as at Katikati or as members of the Orange Order, they subscribed to a collective enterprise in part of their lives. But tellingly, as the chapters by Patterson, Arabin, Sweetman and Nolan show, neither George Vesey Stewart's 'Ulster Plantation' at Katikati, nor that institutional embodiment of *certain* forms of Irish Protestant *mentalité*, the Orange Order, survived for long unchanged — or exercised untrammelled influence — in New Zealand. Both adapted to colonial circumstance, mutating in ways which their progenitors could not have foreseen.

So what to make of this book? None of the contributions disappoint at one level. The individual scholarship is impressive, the style is engaging and the chapters are generally well written. If there is a problem, it is a conceptual one and may relate to the book's institutional genesis. The central theme throughout is identity: its individual and collective expression; how this is framed, negotiated and contested, and its instability, contingency and multiplicity. These are notoriously elusive issues, none of which can be easily bounded in regional or denominational terms.

LINDSAY PROUDFOOT