

get a chance to make more films'. Dunleavy charts television's large contribution to that change. Her discussion of the rise of bi-cultural drama is a real strength in this work.

I have doubts over various of Dunleavy's judgments. As one instance, the first television dramas were not well received by the local audience. Dunleavy puts the non-supportive, often antagonistic, reaction down to a cultural cringe. My own argument, the work, alas, unconsidered here, is that the late entry of local drama meant inevitably raw productions were presented to people who had happily watched bad local television years earlier but were no longer naïve viewers. Dunleavy wears her heart on her sleeve. She sits firmly in the camp of writers and producers with little time for the efforts and values of policy makers and administrators. She has marked views on aspects of New Zealand history. There is the 'notorious' Governor Grey, the Chapman report is 'tragically' ignored. Readers may or may not agree with such judgments. Certainly few are well supported. But these are minor quibbles with a work that covers considerable territory, much of it relatively uncharted. Television drama is of great interest and consequence but, by the nature of its transmission, soon fades from memory and is often lost. Dunleavy provides an excellent counter to that and her book is a welcome addition to the literature on New Zealand's television history.

PATRICK DAY

University of Waikato

Tackling Rugby Myths: Rugby and New Zealand Society 1854–2004. Edited by Greg Ryan. University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 2005. 247 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877276-97-9.

IN HIS INTRODUCTION TO *TACKLING RUGBY MYTHS*, penned shortly after the All Blacks' semi-final elimination from the 2003 Rugby World Cup by a superior Australian XV, Greg Ryan highlighted the anxiety felt by many New Zealanders at the All Blacks' continuing failure to succeed in the showpiece tournament. Central to that disquiet, he wrote, 'is an assumption that the long established unity, continuity and invincibility of New Zealand rugby has been at least eroded, perhaps even sabotaged by forces acting contrary to the best interests of the game'. This collection of essays deals with that angst, identifying limits and deficiencies in the existing historical writing on rugby in New Zealand, and questioning deeply held assumptions about the nature of the 'national game'.

Tackling Rugby Myths is unusual for an edited collection in that four of the 11 chapters plus the introduction are written by one author, Greg Ryan. Two of Ryan's chapters confront directly the myth that the heartland of New Zealand rugby lies in the provinces, where generations of hard and hardy rural men, Colin Meads the exemplar, shaped the culture of the game and guaranteed New Zealand's supremacy. Armed with convincing, detailed data on the composition of All Black teams of the past, Ryan shows the predominantly urban origins of the All Blacks before World War II. 'Contrary to the myth, urbanisation and centralisation were the key determinants of continuity in New Zealand rugby', he explains (p.46). This urban orientation remained largely true throughout the post-war period. Consequently, popular explanations of the repeated All Black failures of the late 1990s — such as the claim that New Zealand men have lost their hardness as a result of the insidious spread of Auckland's cappuccino culture — culminating in the 1999 World Cup semi-final loss to the crotch-grabbing, eye-gouging French, are misplaced. Given the selective memory that underpins popular understandings of the All Blacks' 'invincibility', such explanations derive from 'a set of myths and clichés that holds no relevance to the actual nature of New Zealand rugby at any time during the twentieth century' (p.172). Ryan's other chapters explore the early history of Maori rugby and the vexed issue of the South African connection and its implications for Maori

participation in the game. Again, Ryan's impressive array of evidence makes a persuasive case that the Maori engagement with the game has been more riven with division than is generally recognized.

A central theme of the book is the inadequacy of the scholarship on New Zealand rugby. Ryan and several of the other authors take their fellow historians to task for studies that have fuelled misunderstandings of rugby's past and its role in New Zealand society. Jock Phillips's misplaced comma that created a figure of 50,000 affiliated players in the 1890s rather than 5000 is held responsible for exaggerating the extent of the game's popularity. Geoff Vincent criticizes Phillips's assertion of the classlessness of the game in the colonial period. Instead, Vincent's data for Canterbury suggests rugby 'started among, and for several years remained the preserve of, the urban and rural elite and the middling classes who played and socialized with their own kind' (p.27). Caroline Daley's meticulous re-reading of the 1905 Originals tour effectively shows historians' complicity in inventing traditions surrounding the celebrated team. Daley's detailed research in contemporary sources leads her to complain justifiably, 'the ways some of my fellow historians have played with the contemporary sources disturbs me, but more than that, the predictable pattern into which they place the pieces of the jigsaw puzzle frustrates me' (p.87).

Other chapters explore rugby's impact on New Zealand society. Geoff Vincent addresses colonial concerns about the dark side of the game, its association with gambling and violence. Frazer Andrewes uses the 1956 Springbok tour to explore mid-twentieth-century images of masculinity. And, in an admirable chapter, Charlotte Hughes questions whether the 1981 Springbok tour challenged New Zealand's prevailing pattern of gender relations as some writers have suggested. Though cautious about reading too much into a limited study, Hughes is sceptical that a potent challenge to gender norms occurred at this time.

The final chapters address present-day concerns. Drawing on the work of Norbert Elias, Camilla Obel and Terry Austrin discuss anxieties about mobility in the game. Is the large-scale movement overseas of New Zealand players a mercenary development governed by greed or an export success story? Their argument — that the success of the professional game in this country is possible because the game is not global — points to a major roadblock confronting the game's administrators both locally and internationally. Finally, Len Richardson, in the most wide-ranging chapter of the collection, looks at rugby's experience of professionalism in the light of the restructuring of other sports, including rugby league and cricket. He argues that the advent of professionalism in New Zealand rugby appeared relatively straightforward: 'The trilogy that was the cornerstone of the game in New Zealand — club, province, nation — seemed, as many observers noted, to provide a cohesive framework which allowed change to occur rapidly' (p.202). However, the loss of the 2003 World Cup sub-hosting rights, chronically unstable leadership on and off the field, and continuing concern about the reshaping of domestic competitions to fit the 'new era' of professionalism suggest, as Richardson notes, the continuing power of local and provincial interests to challenge the New Zealand Rugby Union's boardroom's control over the national game.

In all, this is a stimulating collection of essays that ought to generate much-needed debate about the history of rugby in New Zealand and about the wider purpose of sports history. Whether it will is unclear. The revisioning of rugby history it proposes runs up against myths as staunch as 'Pinetree' Meads himself.

It is appropriate that this review has been written in the immediate aftermath of the All Blacks' success in retaining the Bledisloe Cup. Even their third such consecutive 'success' has not quietened the unease many devotees of the New Zealand game have about old certainties and the current direction of the 'national game'. In fact, it is hard to avoid the New Zealanders' neuroses over issues including the effects of professionalism, the Polynesian influence on the game, the inappropriateness of the 'new' man-management-style coaching, the abandonment of Saturday afternoon test football, the scarcity of male

school teachers, and, most recently, the efficacy of the medical advice given to Daniel Carter for his injured leg. Certainty about All Black excellence, and New Zealand's premiere position in the international game, is a thing of the past. Indeed, at the time of writing only one certainty can be noted — that the All Blacks are again peaking too soon for the next World Cup. The same surely can not be said of two-time cup holders Australia.

MALCOLM CAMPBELL

The University of Auckland

Waitangi Revisited: Perspectives on the Treaty of Waitangi. Edited by Michael Belgrave, Merata Kawharu and David Williams. Oxford University Press, Melbourne, 2004. xxi, 402 pp. NZ price: \$65.00. ISBN 0-1955-8400-7.

THIS BOOK IS A VALUABLE UPDATE of the 1989 collection edited by Hugh Kawharu, not simply a revision but a new work. If the last 15 years have seen considerable development in legal and political approaches to the Treaty, the likely outcomes remain obscure. This timely volume sets out a variety of perspectives, beginning with Mason Durie's incisive survey of the issues. Various essays draw attention to topics of greater and lesser complexity, such as Mereta Kawharu's helpful discussion of social policy and Ann Williams's consideration of Maori in the parliamentary sphere. Tom Bennion's discussion of the foreshore and seabed is a subtle and informative exposition of the legal situation as it has evolved, and chapters on hapu and community perspectives are helpful case studies. One might note, however, that all the contributors are North Islanders and only one has even tenuous links with the south; perhaps Ngai Tahu might have contributed a useful reflection on post-settlement issues?

Some chapters are disappointing. Ranginui Walker, strangely, discusses tribal claims to fisheries without mentioning Ngai Tahu or Muriwhenua. This is like the Battle of Hastings without the Normans. Maui Solomon on the flora and fauna claim is more partisan than useful, and his portrayal of innate Maori environmental wisdom would be disputed by some. Since, moreover, Solomon informs us that the claim is also about 'Maori values', one might ask which Maori values? On homosexuality, for instance, the values of Archbishop Vercoe or the values of Witi Ihimaera? The issues around indigenous rights with respect to natural resources are too important to be treated simplistically, and the portrayal of a uniform 'Maori' perspective leaves hostages to fortune. Michael Belgrave's discussion of the Waitangi Tribunal's historiography is useful in its admonition that the Crown needs to be understood in a nuanced not a monolithic fashion. The term is a mystification, and not only in this context; we badly need to reflect on how we understand a democratic state that has particular obligations to or relationships with descendants of the first settlers. Allen Bartley and Paul Spoonley engage with the complexities of biculturalism and multiculturalism, noting that we have no official ideology of multiculturalism. Issues of identity in a multiethnic nation with an official ideology of unity rather than diversity and an assertive indigenous population need much further discussion and this chapter is a good start.

Paul McHugh writes a customarily excellent chapter on New Zealand's evolving constitutional arrangements. There is a good discussion of other issues in rights-talk: who has the rights over what and to do what? Who is representative? How is authority constituted? Paul McHugh is also the only contributor who, on the foreshore and seabed, asks the hard and fundamental question: 'how were Maori rights — whatever they were and whoever held them — to be balanced with those of the community at large?' (p.301). Andrew Sharp also confronts hard issues in a discussion of constitutionalism, noting three mutually incompatible forms: the legal orthodoxy of indivisible sovereignty, Maori or