

to Jock Phillips's binary opposition between wowserite (religious) masculinity and the hegemonic boozier/hard-man. Justine Smith's study of the YMCA in Dunedin demonstrates that some popular masculinities readily incorporated virility and religion, while Kieran O'Connell illustrates that religion could be formative in men's lives even when formal religious association was weak. Future discussion about masculinity will need to consider 'muscular Christianity' more carefully, though the term's meaning in twentieth-century New Zealand still needs clarification. The book concludes strongly with chapters by Karyn-Maree Piercy on the early-twentieth-century Deaconess movement, and Angela Matthews on the introduction of 'an Anglican female priesthood'.

The last set of essays illustrates particularly clearly how important social and cultural history approaches have become in recent religious historical writing. In this book clergy, missionaries and institutional material are all still prominent. Yet questions of gender, race, complexity, variety and the experiences of smaller religious groupings are apparent throughout. Popular religion is a significant theme in some of the more recent research, and there is clearly much scope for work in this area.

Most of the essays provide excellent introductions to their subjects. However, at points, the volume could have been enhanced by paying greater attention to the interpretive sections. For example, Matthews' otherwise admirable essay concludes rather weakly that women priests were accepted quickly in New Zealand because 'there was a greater readiness to change than in other communities'. Similarly, historiographical issues might have been explored further, especially with some of the better-known subjects. Grant Phillipson provides a good overview of early Colenso, but consciously resists engagement with the more controversial debates about him.

Unfortunately, there are one or two production blemishes. The endnote numbering is out of synch for some of the early chapters, as is one of the titles. More substantially, the titles of some chapters are more ambitious than their delivery. Keith Furniss's history of Moray Place Congregational Church purportedly covers 1862 to 1966, but there is not much to be gleaned from the half page devoted to the years after 1893. O'Connell's chapter provides interesting case studies of some Dunedin 'men', but could have developed the idea of 'Christian masculinities' more clearly.

Despite these observations, this book makes a significant contribution. Nothing else in the field quite compares for breadth, and this alone makes it noteworthy and commendable. The collection provides solid introductions to some familiar topics, but also breaks genuinely new ground. It suggests that there are new religious tales worth telling and old ones worth revisiting. Moreover, it successfully demonstrates that the study of religions can help illuminate subjects of general historical interest and importance. Hopefully this will stimulate further graduate work of similar quality, and encourage others to develop some of the broader implications more fully.

GEOFF TROUGHTON

Massey University – Palmerston North

A Question of Faith: A History of the New Zealand Christian Pacifist Society. By David Grant. Philip Garside Publishing, Wellington, 2004. 120 pp. NZ price: \$29.95. ISBN 0-9582275-8-6.

THIS BOOK MAY BE UNDERSTOOD as a farewell, not without poignancy. Throughout the 60-plus years of its existence, the Christian Pacifist Society was sometimes vilified, more often ignored, never honoured in its own country. In 2002, the decision having been made to wind up the Society, a remaining bequest provided sufficient funds to commission David Grant to write a history. Grant was already well known to members.

He had published *Out in the Cold: Pacifists and Conscientious Objectors in New Zealand During World War II* (1986) which had given prominence to the CPS's wartime tribulations and which used material provided by CPS individuals. A good half of the present book traverses the same ground. As earlier, too, Grant does not search much for sources outside those generated by pacifists themselves or engage with the general literature on peace movements and work specifically on New Zealand. No interesting insights here. But the narrative is informative and neatly gathered, and that, presumably, is the most Grant's sponsors expected or wanted.

Most readers will regard the CPS as a curiosity. Even the term 'pacifist' is outdated, evoking a negativity and exclusiveness that members themselves felt increasingly uncomfortable with; from the 1960s there were moves to change the name of the Society to a Fellowship of Reconciliation, and in 1987 its magazine became *The Peacemaker*. But a fundamental reorientation never occurred. The CPS remained essentially inward-looking, more concerned to protect its ideological purity than achieve political influence, though it did in the long period of its decline after World War II maintain links with the wider peace movement and humanitarian organizations. The dilution that the leadership resisted was amendment of the Covenant that required members to be church committed and to pledge themselves to oppose all war as contrary to Christ's teachings. Such moral certainty, not to say political and theological naivety, is what makes the CPS appear a curiosity.

As stated, Grant never considered it part of his brief to examine how idealism of this kind arose in New Zealand. But it is useful to be reminded of whether the CPS was taken by its 'absolutism' during the war and of how ineptly the New Zealand authorities dealt with the dissidence of conscientious objectors. Hubert Holdaway and Archibald Barrington's Riverside Community, near Motueka, can also be said to have utopianized Christian pacifism. If we are to go beyond description, reading *A Question of Faith* is most like reading the history of a (Christian) sect. For one thing, though relatively long-lived as a peace organization, the CPS failed to outlive the generation that founded it. It literally faded away in the 1990s as those who had been ardent in the cause in the thirties and forties died off. Further, Ormond Burton and, to a lesser extent, Barrington were the leaders and teachers around whom all revolved. Their absolutism had no leaks whatever, nor was their authority ever effectively challenged. Burton's idea of the distinctiveness of the CPS's pacifism prevailed, even after he left the Society in 1970 in protest at its proposed affiliation with a 'general peace society' (p.96). This was the sect leader deploring the backsliding of his followers. One can even discern the different degrees of association maintained within a sect — the leader and his acolytes, those committed enough to attend meetings and a large penumbra of supporters who received literature, if they did not offer other support.

As a postscript, a protest must be entered against the poor editing of this volume. Some errors belong to juvenile writing, 'Thompson handed these reigns over to Jim Pollock' (p.93). Punctuation and capitalization are often wayward; writing ungrammatical or obfuscatory, '[The Labour Party] settled upon a defence policy which was to carry it through relatively unchanged until 1935' (p.9). A personal grievance is that the reviewer's grandfather is thrice cited, always inaccurately: as Ernest *Andrew* in the index, as *Sir Ernest Andrews* in 1946 (he was knighted in 1950), and as the author of *Methodism and Society* (in fact, it was *Stuart Andrews*).

JOHN COOKSON

University of Canterbury