

inevitably make the reader wonder whether he is resurrecting these women to free them, or to continue their role as exotic captives.

The question of Bentley's motives raises itself early in the book. Take for example his description of Badger: 'With her fair hair and white skin she must have ranked among the most famous of the exotic curiosities' (p.33). But, though he is cautious about romanticizing Badger's life amongst Maori, within the very same paragraph Bentley, on an unknown basis, describes Badger as possessing 'loose hair, tanned skin, bare feet, [and] Maori adornments' (p.37). On the same page, Maori rangatira 'preferred monogamy', so Charlotte 'may' have lived in a superior carved house and enjoyed a better position than commoner Maori. But just three pages earlier, Bentley claims rangatira in general were polygamous, commonly with a number of captive slave wives possessing no status (and presumably no adornments) (p.34).

In the conclusion to the book, Bentley argues, again presumably on the basis of 'informed speculation', that it is possible 'the quality of the cross-cultural relationships between the white women and their male protector husbands was far better than what the women had previously experienced with their European husbands' (pp.240–1). With statements like this, the reader cannot avoid reaching the conclusion that Bentley is straying from the realms of historical research and analysis and into the world of romantic fiction. This world in fact reinforces the role of these women as captured exotics (whether in reality or in the narratives) rather than as having their own agency and making their own choices. And it tells us nothing of Maori society's view of them, or how they illuminate life on the frontier.

This book represents a lost opportunity. While Bentley clearly views the captured women as some kind of super heroines, he has not used what we do know of these rare captive experiences to reflect on the other, far more common side of early interaction between Maori and Pakeha. The fact is that the vast majority of examples of early contact were remarkable for the degree of positive, chosen interaction between the two groups, rather than for the very few, and still factually hazy, cases of white female captivity.

KATE RIDDELL

Waitangi Tribunal

Steadfast in Hope: The Story of the Catholic Archdiocese of Wellington, 1850–2000. By Michael O'Meeghan SM. Dunmore Press, Palmerston North, 2003. 371 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 0-86469-449-0.

THE CATHOLIC ARCHDIOCESE OF WELLINGTON includes the lower part of the North Island and the top of the South Island. It was formed in 1848 out of Bishop Jean-Baptiste Pompallier's vast domain. Its first bishop, Philippe Viard, arrived to take up his see in 1850. The diocese was reduced in 1869, when the diocese of Dunedin was formed, reduced again in 1887 with the establishment of the Christchurch diocese (while Wellington became an archdiocese), and yet again in 1980 with the creation of the diocese of Palmerston North. Michael O'Meeghan, a Marist priest and author of a history of the diocese of Christchurch, has written an impressive account of the Wellington archdiocese, including districts it incorporated until the time of their excision.

While the Forward by Cardinal Thomas Williams emphasizes Vatican II's description of the Church as a pilgrim people, this is an institutional history rather than the story of the people. Chapter 21 on the Maori Mission ('The Cinderella Mission') humbly declares that it would be 'presumptuous for a New Zealand writer of European background to assess what impact the Maori missionaries have had on the Maori' (p.289). The approach in this chapter, however, is essentially the same as in other chapters, where the history

of the diocese is essentially the history of the clergy and the religious, along with some mention of those laity most closely involved in the concerns of the hierarchy (such as the once-secretive Knights of the Southern Cross). Chapters 18 and 19 on the post-war years, for example, are largely a record of the introduction of new religious orders. Lay people are more often discussed as ethnic immigrants or settlers — recipients of the Church's ministrations — than as religious actors in their own right. The book includes some discussion of centrally organized lay piety, for example the St Vincent de Paul Society, the Catholic Women's League and the Holy Name Society, but it neglects such important developments as Father Patrick Peyton's international rosary crusade and the charismatic movement.

As ecclesiastical rather than religious history, the book fulfils its real agenda admirably. The Author's Note modestly avers that 'this book breaks some new ground', but, with its extensive use of the archdiocesan archives, it provides a detailed narrative that could not be constructed from other secondary sources. Despite the dates in the subtitle, the first three chapters are principally concerned with the establishment of the Church in the region before 1850. Quite a large proportion of the book deals with the establishment of small-town parishes as they were linked up by rail. The Maori Mission, Catholic education and other perennial concerns, such as private hospitals, receive a fair share of attention. Greater emphasis is placed on more specifically religious matters in chapter 20 ('Opening Windows') on the implementation of the Vatican II reforms. The final chapter ('Towards Jubilee 2000') focuses on important developments during the last two decades of the twentieth century, such as the establishment of the new diocesan administrative centre, the practice of holding synods with strong lay representation, the papal visit of 1986 and declining church attendance.

The author does not shy away from tensions within the Church, for example over ecclesiastical appointments. He also examines at length two major public controversies. One concerned the severity of punishments meted out by the Marist Brothers at the turn of the century to absconders and other delinquents at the Stoke Orphanage for Boys. O'Meeghan presents his own judgments (which, being based on a judicious scrutiny of the sources, are most welcome), but useful material in articles and theses is often ignored. Secondly, in 1930, Archbishop Thomas O'Shea advised the Bible in Schools League that the bishops would not oppose its Religious Instruction in Public Schools Enabling Bill. O'Shea was supposed to be acting on behalf of the other bishops, but they publicly disowned him. O'Meeghan follows O'Shea's interpretation of these events, namely that his colleagues, aggrieved at Protestant unwillingness to endorse the Church's educational claims, withdrew their original acceptance of the League's proposals as conveyed to O'Shea by Bishop James Liston of Auckland. He ignores an article by Ivan Snook, published in this journal in 1972, arguing that O'Shea misinterpreted what Liston had said.

Despite a rather unquestioning view of O'Shea in this context, the author is usually quite willing to be more critical. Elsewhere, O'Shea receives much of the blame for the inadequacy of the Church's care for Maori Catholics (pp.303–4), while the legendary proportions of Archbishop Francis Redwood are somewhat reduced in scale (p.213). Perhaps the title of chapter 18 ('Peter the Great'), which introduces Cardinal McKeefry, is intended to be ambivalent.

Steadfast in Hope is attractively produced, with just a few misprints. To facilitate reading and reference, some chapters are broken down into sections with headings, but others that traverse a variety of topics are not. There are a number of maps and other illustrations (but no list of either). Some maps are quite striking, notably the one of Taranaki (p.141), but in others the print is hard to read against the shaded background (especially the Whanganui River map on p.184). Another map would have been particularly useful in the chapter on the Maori Mission, while the three illustrations of

grand cathedrals that were never built might justly have given way to one or two of the many humbler mid-twentieth-century parish churches that actually were.

As the author of a diocesan history, O'Meehan understandably decided to make the subject more manageable by relying on diocesan sources and not writing any more than necessary about broader issues. Herein lies a strength and a limitation. Concentrating on the archives of the Wellington Archdiocese has produced an impressive and detailed work to which future historians will be indebted, but its perspective is naturally that of the administrators who compiled the archive, not that of the pilgrim people who make up the Church. A number of secondary sources are indicated in the notes (not always on religious topics), but a bibliography would have been useful to both researchers and general readers.

CHRISTOPHER VAN DER KROGT

Massey University

Building God's Own Country: Historical Essays on Religions in New Zealand. Edited by John Stenhouse and Jane Thomson. University of Otago Press, Dunedin, 2004. 272 pp. NZ price: \$39.95. ISBN 1-877276-92-8.

BUILDING GOD'S OWN COUNTRY is the third in a series by the University of Otago Press aiming to bring graduate student research before a wider audience. There has been considerable interest in religious subjects in recent years and this volume serves an excellent function in making research in that area more readily available. The 15 essays included derive from work completed at Otago between 1975 and 2001. Most relate to the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, with just one dedicated to the years after World War II. One happy consequence of this concentration is that burned-over themes like secularization and the Geering controversy are absent. This makes for a fresh and appealing collection.

As John Stenhouse's introduction admits, the contributions have been grouped 'somewhat arbitrarily' into four sections. Nonetheless, these are well crafted and flow logically. The first section deals with 'Southern Presbyterians'. Knox Church in Dunedin features prominently; its first minister, the Rev. D.M Stuart, is the subject of one chapter, and its music another. There are also particularly significant contributions by Rosalind McClean and Alison Clarke. McClean's chapter on 'Scottish Piety' details patterns of belonging, social composition and religious identity in the earliest years of the Otago settlement, and offers unusually sympathetic interpretations of Thomas Burns and Free Church disciplinary regimes. Clarke's deft study of nineteenth-century Sabbath-keeping emphasizes the ideological priority of worker protection over respectability. Like others in this section, she also challenges caricatures of Presbyterianism as unalterably dour and uniform by providing examples of innovation, variety and warmth.

The second grouping considers 'Communities of Faith' — an eclectic array of small but interesting groups from around Otago such as the Congregational Church at Moray Place, Dunedin's Jewish community and the diminutive but controversial Salvation Army at Milton. A fourth chapter, by Billie McLeod, fills a gap in the recent literature on the Dunedin-based (Irish) Catholic periodical the *New Zealand Tablet* by providing a survey of its origins and content under Bishop Moran. A similarly diverse third section on 'Missionary Encounters' tackles the career of CMS printer William Colenso during his years at Paihia, early Mormon Mission activity among Pakeha and Maori and Alexander Don, the pioneer Presbyterian missionary to Otago's Chinese goldminers.

The final section, on 'Gender', includes two essays that explore Protestant Christianity's influence on New Zealand masculinities. These extend Stenhouse's own recent challenge