

administration. From the 1890s women were appointed by the Boards primarily, Tennant tells us, on the argument that women would prove more effective than men at 'snooping upon their own sex'.

Tennant ends this monograph with a salutary warning about the potentials of 'community care'. Her study of case files has shown a 'community' far from 'caring', much less cohesive than the concept allows, and a background not of neighbourly solidarity but of family and neighbourly altercations, petty grievances and tale-telling. She concludes that the community has been far from successful in providing for past social casualties.

This is undoubtedly a much-needed study, and will be essential reading for students of New Zealand's social welfare history, social history, and women's history. It fills an important gap.

LINDA BRYDER

University of Auckland

The Caring Commodity. The Provision of Health Care in New Zealand. By Iain Hay. Oxford University Press, Auckland, 1989. 207pp. NZ price: \$34.95.

AS THE FIRST overview of the politics of health care in New Zealand in the period from 1840 to the present day, this book will be a valuable aid for teaching and research in this area. Hay tells us in his final chapter that this is 'not just a narrative of New Zealand's health care history. It also presents a view of the relations and processes underlying change in that history.' This is, of course, what one would hope and expect of a modern history. It is in the final section that Hay is most successful in achieving this aim.

The pre-1935 section is marred by factual errors, inadequate sources, and sometimes inadequate interpretation. Duncan MacGregor's death is dated at 1907 (rather than 1906) (p. 30), MacGregor's annual hospital report of 1895 is incorrectly cited in the text as appearing in 1885 (p.30), the British Medical Association (BMA) is said to have been founded in 1882 and then changed its name in 1865 (p.35), and W.H. Oliver is misquoted (p.62). On p.39 we are told that nineteenth-century public health was 'characterised by a general lack of interest and organisation', and on the next page that after the 1874 Public Health Act 'Auckland administered an effective and lasting public health policy'. In his discussion of the New Zealand Branch of the BMA and the professionalization of medicine there is no mention of R.E. Wright-St Clair's history of the association (1987) and, more important, of Michael Belgrave's PhD thesis on this subject (1985). J.P.S. Jamieson, who led the medical profession's fight against the Labour government in the 1930s, is quoted as a source for the founding of the BMA: 'At that time, the health of many members of the British public was poor, sanitary conditions were appalling, and mortality rates were high . . . Hastings' association was to remedy these problems' (p.35). Most medical historians would reject this interpretation of the founding of the BMA, which had more to do with professionalization than a sudden realization of the poor health of the British public. Nor would most New Zealand historians agree that the extension of health services in New Zealand during the First World War was primarily for 'compassionate reasons, and in an economic flush' (p.48). The First World War was a time when health attracted a great deal of interest in relation to 'national efficiency' and the next generation, and it is no coincidence that the first free treatment Hay mentions is maternity treatment.

In the chapter dealing with 1935-42, the debates on health provision between the Labour government and the medical profession are chronicled. Although he relies heavily on the work of Elizabeth Hanson and D.G. Bolitho, Hay provides some interesting insights into these debates. However, there is little about Labour party ideology and he

does not really explain why the Labour government left the dual system intact, which is an important starting point for his analysis of the next period.

It is in the post-Second World War period that Hay's study comes into its own. This section provides the most significant contribution to the history of health care in New Zealand. Hay attempts to analyze the reasons behind growing privatization of medicine in New Zealand in this period — the respective roles played by the governments (in particular National governments), the medical profession, and medical insurance (in particular the Southern Cross Medical Care Society) — building on G.M. Fougere's important studies. Medical insurance, which now covers over one million people, including employer and union-organized schemes, he sees as a major factor contributing to the run-down of public services. He also considers the role played by the Accident Compensation Act of 1972 in this process (an Act which was based on the report of the Royal Commission published in 1967, and not 1976, as Hay tells us (p.175'). Hay concludes that the dual system of health provision is producing more 'medical indigents', and that access to medical care is being determined more and more by ability to pay (or to belong to an insurance scheme) than by need.

Despite its deficiencies, this book is a welcome contribution to a field of history which is only just beginning to develop in New Zealand.

LINDA BRYDER

University of Auckland

The History of Policing in New Zealand, Volume II: The Colonial Frontier Tamed: New Zealand Policing in Transition, 1867-1886 By Richard S. Hill. Historical Branch, Department of Internal Affairs, Wellington, 1989. 386 pp. NZ price: \$39.95.

AS WITH VOLUME I of this major study of policing in New Zealand, Hill is here reporting back after an arduous journey through the sources. He has made himself at home in the very extensive archival material and the official printed sources, and also combed a wide range of newspapers. He has been extremely thorough and hardworking on his journey, but again, as with Volume I, he has had some difficulty in putting together a clear, coherent and engrossing account of his travels.

This is not surprising, for besides the problem of summarizing from an overwhelming mass of detail, he has had to cope with an inherently tangled and complicated story. As the dust jacket succinctly puts it, the volume 'examines the various forms which policing took in a period when both Maori and pakeha society moved from relative turbulence to relative quiescence: provincial forces, the Armed Constabulary in its fighting and demilitarised phases, and the Police Branch and Reserve/Field Force Division of the New Zealand Constabulary Force'. There have been, then, both the civil policing and the military stories to weave into the account, together with their often complicated interactions. There have been the changing characters of Maori and Pakeha society, and their interaction both in peace and in war. Perhaps most complicating of all has been the way the provincial system shattered the Pakeha story into divergent splinters, some of them dragging the story down to parish pump level. And the relationship of these provincial splinters to the shifting agenda of the central government adds complication to complication, as their confused politics interact. Chapter 7, 'The Auckland Policing Experiment', with its blow-by-blow account (almost 50 pages) of the tortuous politics and tangled administration of the first experiment in bringing provincial policing under central control, is an example of dogged perseverance in the researcher that makes almost superhuman demands on the tenacity of the reader.

One cannot but admire Hill's stamina in wrestling his recalcitrant materials into