

*Te Whenua, Te Iwi: the land and the people*. Edited by Jock Phillips. Allen & Unwin/Port Nicholson Press, in association with Stout Research Centre, Wellington, 1987. 108pp. NZ price: \$24.95.

*TE WHENUA, Te Iwi: the land and the people* is the textual residue of the second Stout Centre conference, held at Wellington, 21–23 June 1985. The contributors include two poets/novelists (Keri Hulme and Ian Wedde), an art historian (Francis Pound), an anthropologist (Helen Leach), two sociologists (Ian Carter and Nick Perry), a literary critic (Roger Horrocks), the Chief Judge of the Maori Land Court (Eddie Durie), two Maori academics (Ranginui Walker and Robert Mahuta), a social historian (Rollo Arnold), a scientist with the Department of Conservation (Geoff Park), and a forestry officer (Alistair Graham). In addition, William Main exhibits a small gallery of photographic 'Images'; and there is a judicious introduction by the editor. Without exception, the contributions eschew the more arid scholastic formulae and 'speak' with refreshing directness; and the result is a symposium both entertaining and instructive.

The papers are grouped under four headings, entitled 'Personal statements', 'Beginnings', 'Myths', and 'Uses'. This arrangement suggests some interesting contrasts and parallels between what Phillips calls 'two peoples, two cultures, two relationships with the land'. It is possible, nevertheless, to consider the papers as forming three distinctive and divergent discourses.

One is that offered by the tangata whenua, for whom the relationship of land and people is in essence unproblematic, but in practice threatened by the historical circumstances of colonization. For Keri Hulme, Eddie Durie, Robert Mahuta, and Ranginui Walker there is a symbiotic relationship which must be maintained (Keri Hulme, for her part, lights fires on the beaches of Moeraki and Okarito) or, where fractured, restored: Durie, Mahuta, and Walker each express a sense of urgency about what Maori people must do, and they specify what can be done, given any kind of reasonable opportunity. But, says Mahuta, 'we cannot even begin. . . while we are locked into other people's developments and needs'.

The second discourse is a critique of Pakeha attempts to fashion a 'usable culture' that will express a satisfactory relationship between colonizers and land (and which, by implication, will be equivalent to, or will supplant, the normative relationship of the tangata whenua). Roger Horrocks provides a 'history of competing meanings', sketching the recent challenges, in particular those presented by Maori artists, by feminists, and by the theoretical analysts of cultural production, to what Horrocks terms the "Landfall" tradition' that has been so dominant in high culture. In a giddy deconstructive romp, Ian Wedde explores (and makes fun of) the 'provincialising of conventions' in art, in verse, in sport, in popular culture. Francis Pound is more rigorous and more polemical in his exposure of the ideological content in New Zealand landscape painting and art criticism. Ian Carter and Nick Perry analyse the codes of popular culture through identifying the cultural practices in three television advertisements: 'The land wars are not over', they conclude, 'they are waged on our television screens every night'. These four papers identify some of the most basic modes of cultural colonization.

There are four other contributions to be noted. Helen Leach reconstructs 'the relationship of the first Polynesian settlers to their new surroundings in Aotearoa'. Rollo Arnold describes the 'potent practical ideas that actually shaped the settler countryside and community' for the 'gentry' and (more extensively) the 'yeoman settlers' of the nineteenth century. Geoff Park muses about the 'convergence of person and place' within an ecological context. Alistair Graham offers a co-operative-style, 'think small', ecologically-sensitive model of land use. These papers are excellent delineations of the substan-

tive topics they take as their subjects. At another level, they might be read as attempts to define the conditions under which the colonizers could forge an unproblematic relationship with the land. It is not only on the television screens that the 'land wars' are still being waged.

Like all recent books from this publisher, the volume is well-designed. The varied forms of annotation employed in different contributions are a matter of interest rather than irritation. An index ought to have been added. There are a couple of minor blemishes: the macron floats on and off Okarito with the tides; for McCormack, on page 56, read McCormick; and on page 63 antimony should be antinomy — or have I missed the joke?

P. J. GIBBONS

*University of Waikato*

*The Limits of Hope. Soldier Settlement in Victoria 1915–38.* By Marilyn Lake. Oxford University Press, Melbourne, 1987. xviii, 317pp. Australian price: \$A35.00.

SOME YEARS ago I interviewed an elderly Queensland police officer who was stationed near the Beerburrum Soldier Settlement in the 1920s. With some exaggeration, he retailed harrowing accounts of life at that miserable place, where returned soldiers had a propensity for leaping off the Glasshouse Mountains.

Marilyn Lake's heart-breaking account of discharged soldiers and their young families settled on small farms in Victoria is even more dramatic and tragic. Between 1916 and 1917, 40,000 soldier settlers and their 60,000 dependants were placed on the land in Australia. At least 60% of them had disappeared by the onset of the Great Depression — a failure rate roughly comparable to that of the small selectors in the eastern states of Australia between 1860 and 1875. Nor was this tragedy confined to Australia. In New Zealand, where a similar attempt at social engineering and national gratitude was tried, at least 5000 of the 11,000 men who were financed on to the land were in difficulties by 1923, and most of the capital invested, mainly in the form of inflated land values, was ultimately written off. In Canada, where over 30,000 returned soldiers were settled on farms, mainly in the prairie provinces, over 14,000 had failed by the 1930s.

Yet in Australia the disasters were greater than in the other Dominions. As Lake indicates, this was particularly true of the Victorian closer-settlement schemes. Here is fruitful ground for the comparative historian working on problems first delineated in J. M. Powell's seminal article in the June 1981 issue of the *Journal of Australian Studies*. Why was the ideological emphasis on closer settlement so powerful in the country with the highest urban concentrations in the Empire? Were the lives of the Anzac pioneers and their families harsher than those of their comrades across the Pacific — if indeed one can measure human pain? What was the contribution of severe environmental and social problems? Did technological and scientific advances in artificial grassland farming, co-operative endeavour, and distance create critical areas of difference? Was the texture of rural political sophistication and organization significantly different in New Zealand's 'strugglers' gullies'?

Lake has supplied some of the human answers to these questions, but not without a certain amount of unnecessary repetition and criss-crossing of rather well-trodden ground in the history of Australian land settlement. Perhaps, in using about 300 samples from 11,000 personal files in the Victorian Lands Department, she has not sufficiently taken